THE COURT IS OF OPINION

In so far as concerns the Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide, in the event of a State ratifying or acceding to the Convention subject to a reservation made either on ratification or on accession, or on signature followed by ratification,

On Question 1.

by seven votes to five,

That a State which has made and maintained a reservation which has been objected to by one or more of the parties to the Convention but not by others, can be regarded as being a party to the Convention if the reservation is compatible with the object and purpose of the Convention; otherwise, that State cannot be regarded as being a party to the Convention.

On Question II.

by seven votes to five,

- that if a party to the Convention objects to a reservation which it considers to be incompatible with the object and purpose of the Convention, it can in fact consider that the reserving State is not a party to the Convention;
- that if, on the other hand, a party accepts the reservation as being compatible with the object and purpose of the Convention, it can in fact consider that the reserving State is a party to the Convention;

On Ouestion III.

by seven votes to five,

- that an objection to a reservation made by a signatory State which has not yet ratified the Convention can have the legal effect indicated in the reply to Question 1 only upon ratification. Until that moment it merely serves as a notice to the other State of the eventual attitude of the signatory
- that an objection to a reservation made by a State which is State; entitled to sign or accede but which has not yet done so, is without legal effect.

¹ I.C J. REPORTS, 1951 p.29

ANNEXURE III

GENERAL ASSEMBLY RESOLUTION 598 (V1) 598.(V1) Reservations to Multilateral Conventions

The General Assembly,

Bearing in mind the provisions of its resolution 478 (V) of 16 November 1950, which (1) requested the International Court of Justice to give an advisory opinion regarding reservations to the Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide and (2) invited the International Law Commission to study the question of reservations to multilateral conventions,

Noting the Court's advisory opinion of 28 May 1951 and the Commission's report, both rendered pursuant to the said resolution.

- 1 Recommends that organs of the United Nations, specialized agencies and States should, in the course of preparing multilateral conventions, consider the insertion therein of provisions relating to the admissibility or non-admissibility of reservations and to the effect to be attributed to them;
- 2. Recommends to all States that they be guided in regard to the Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide by the advisory opinion of the International Court of Justice of 28 May 1951;
 - 3. Requests the Secretary-General:
- (a) In relation to reservations to the Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide, to conform his practice to the advisory opinion of the Court of 28 May 1951;
- (b) In respect of future conventions conventions under the auspices of the United Nations of which he is the depositary;

- (i) To continue to act as depositary in connexion with the deposit of documents containing reservations or objections, without passing upon the legal effect of such documents; and
- (ii) To communicate the text of such documents relating to reservations or objections to all States concerned, leaving it to each State to draw legal consequences from such communications

360th plenary meeting, 12 January 1952

¹ See document A\ 1874.

² See Official Records of the General Assembly, Sixth Session, Supplement No. 9. 272

ANNEXURE IV

VIENNA CONVENTION ON THE LAW OF TREATIES, 1969 PART 1

Article 2 USE OF TERMS

1. For the purpose of the present Convention

- (a) "treaty" means an international agreement concluded between States in written form and governed by international law, whether embodied in a single instrument or in two or more related instruments and what ever its particular designation;
- d) "reservation" means a unilateral statement, however phrased or named, made by a State, when signing, ratifying, accepting, approving or acceding to a treaty, whereby it purports to exclude or to modify the legal effect of certain provisions of the treaty in their application to that State;

PART 11

CONCLUSION AND ENTRY INTO FORCE OF TREATIES SEC RION 2: RESERVATIONS

Aricle 19

Formulation of reservations

A State may, when signing, ratifying, accepting, approving or acceding to a treaty, formulate a reservation unless:

(a) the reservation is prohibited by the treaty;

- (b) the treaty provides that only specified reservations, which do not include the reservation in question, may be made; or
- (c) in cases not falling under sub-paragraphs (a) and (b), the reservation is incompatible with the object and purpose of the treaty.

Article 20 Acceptance of and objection to reservations

- 1. A reservation expressly authorized by a treaty does not require any subsequent acceptance by the other contracting States unless the treaty so provides.
- 2. When it appears from the limited number of the negotiating States and the object 'and purpose of a treaty that the application of the treaty in its entirety between all the parties is an essential condition of the consent of each one to be bound by the treaty, a reservation requires acceptance by all the parties.
- 3. When a treaty is a constituent instrument of an international organization and unless it otherwise provides, a reservation requires the acceptance of the competent organ of that organization.
- 4. In cases not falling under the preceding paragraphs and unless the treaty otherwise provides:
- (a) acceptance by another contracting State of a reservation constitutes the reserving State a, party to the treaty in relation to that other State if or when the treaty is in force for those States;
- (b) an objection by another contracting State to a reservation does not preclude the entry into force of the treaty as between the objecting and reserving States unless a contrary intention is definitely expressed by the objecting State;

- (c) an act expressing a State's consent to be bound by the treaty and containing a reservation is effective as soon as at least one other contracting State has accepted the reservation,
- 5. For the purposes of paragraphs 2 and 4 and unless the treaty otherwise provides, a reservation is considered to have been accepted by a State if it shall have raised no objection to the reservation by the end of a period of twelve months after it was notified of the reservation or by the date on which it expressed its consent to be bound by the treaty, whichever is later.

Article 21 Legal effects of reservations and of objections to reservation

- 1. A reservation established with regard to another party in accordance with articles 19, 20 and 23:
 - (a) modifies for the reserving State in its relations with that other party the provisions of the treaty to which the reservation relates to the extent of the reservation; and
 - (b) modifies those provisions to the same extent for that other party in its relations with the reserving State.
- 2. The reservation does not modify the provisions of the other parties to the treaty inter se.
- 3. When a State objecting to a reservation has not opposed the entry into force of the treaty between itself and the reserving State, the provisions to which the reservation relates do not apply as between the two States to the extent of the reservation.

Article 22

Withdrawal of reservations and of objections to reservations

- 1. Unless the treaty otherwise provides, a reservation may be withdrawn at any time and the consent of a State which has accepted the reservation is not required for its withdrawal.
- 2 Unless the treaty otherwise provides, an objection to a reservation may be withdrawn at any time.
 - 3. Unless the treaty otherwise provides, or it is otherwise agreed
 - the withdrawal of a reservation becomes operative in relation to another contracting State only when notice of it has been received by that State;
 - (b) the withdrawal of an objection to a reservation becomes operative only when notice of it has been received by the State which formulated the reservation.

Article 23

Procedure regarding reservations

- 1. A reservation, an express acceptance of a reservation and an objection to a reservation must be formulated in writing and communicated to the contracting States and other States entitled to become parties to the treaty.
- 2. If formulated when signing the treaty subject to ratification, acceptance or approval, a reservation must be formally confirmed by the reserving State when expressing its consent to be bound by the treaty. In such a case the reservation shall be considered as having been made on the date of its confirmation.
- 3. An express acceptance of, or an objection to, a reservation made previously to confirmation of the reservation does not itself require confirmation.

VIENNA CONVENTION ON SUCCESSION OF STATES IN RESPECT OF TREATIES, 1978

PART 1 GENERAL PROVISIONS

Article 2 USE OF TERMS

- 1. For the purpose of the present Convention
- (a) "treaty" means an international agreement concluded between States in written form and governed by international law, whether embodied in a single instrument or in two or more related instruments and what ever its particular designation;
- (j) "reservation" means a unilateral statement, however phrased or named, made by a State, when signing, ratifying, accepting, approving or acceding to a treaty or when making a notification of succession to a treaty, whereby it purports to exclude or to modify the legal effect of certain provisions of the treaty in their application to that State,

PART III NEWLY INDEPENDENT STATES

SECTION 2 MULTILATERAL TREATIES

Article 20 Reservation

When a newly independent State establishes its status as a party or as a contracting State to a multilateral treaty by a notification of succession under article 17 or 18, it shall be considered as maintaining any reservation to that treaty which was applicable at the date of the succession of

States in respect of the territory to which the succession of States relates unless, when making the notification of succession, it expresses a contrary intention or formulates a reservation which relates to the same subject-matter as that reservation.

- 2. When making a notification of succession establishing its status as a party or as a contracting State to a multilateral treaty under article 17 or 18, a newly independent State may formulate a reservation unless the reservation is one the formulation of which would be excluded by the provisions of sub paragraph (a), (b) or (c) of article 19 of the Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties.
- 3. When a newly independent State formulates a reservation in conformity with paragraph 2, the rules set out in articles 20 to 23 of the Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties apply in respect of that reservation.

VIENNA CONVENTION ON THE LAW OF TREATIES BETWEEN STATES AND INTERNATIONAL ORGANIZATIONS OR BETWEEN INTERNATIONAL ORGANIZATIONS, 1986

PART 1

INTRODUCTION

Article 2 USE OF TERMS

- 1. For the purpose of the present Convention:
- (a) "treaty" means an international agreement governed by international law and concluded in written form:
- (i) between one or more States and one or more international organizations; or
 - (ii) between international organizations,

whether that agreement is embodied in a single instrument or in two or more related instruments and what ever its particular designation;

(d) "reservation" means a unilateral statement, however phrased or named, made by a State or an international organization when signing, ratifying, formally confirming, accepting, approving or acceding to a treaty or when making a notification of succession to a treaty, whereby it purports to exclude or to modify the legal effect of certain provisions of the treaty in their application to that State or to that organization;

PART 11 CONCLUSION AND ENTRY INTO FORCE SECTION 2: RESERVATIONS

Article 19

Formulation of reservation

A State or an international organization may, when signing, ratifying, formally confirming, accepting, approving or acceding to a treaty, formulate a

- the reservation is prohibited by the treaty; (a)
- the treaty provides that only specified reservations, which (b) do not include the reservation in question, may be made; or
- in cases not falling under sub-paragraphs (a) and (b), the (c) reservation is incompatible with the object and purpose of the

Acceptance of and objection to reservations

- A reservation expressly authorized by a treaty does not require any subsequent acceptance by the contracting States and contracting organization or, as the case may be, by the contracting organizations unless
- When it appears from the limited number of the negotiating States and negotiating organizations or, as the case may be, of the negotiating organizations and the object and purpose of a treaty that the application of the treaty in its entirety between all the parties is an essential condition of the consent of each one to be bound by the treaty, a reservation requires acceptance
- When a treaty is a constituent instrument of an international organization and unless it otherwise provides, a reservation requires the acceptance of the competent organ of that organization.
- In cases not falling under the preceding paragraphs and unless the treaty otherwise provides.

- acceptance of a reservation by a contracting State or by a (a) contracting Organization constitutes the reserving State or international Organization a party to the treaty in relation to the accepting State or organization if or when the treaty is in force for the reserving State or Organization and for the accepting State or organization;
- an objection by a contracting State or by contracting organisation does not preclude the entry into force of the treaty as between the objecting State or international Organization and the reserving State or Organization unless a contrary intention is definitely expressed by the objecting State' or Organization:
- an act expressing the consent of a State or Of an international Organization to be bound by the treaty and containing a reservation is effective as soon as at least one contracting State or one contracting organization has accepted the reservation.
- For the purposes of paragraphs 2 and 4 and unless the treaty otherwise provides, a reservation is considered to have been accepted by a State or an international organization if it shall have raised no objection to the reservation by the end of a period of twelve months after it was notified of the reservation or by the date on which it expressed its consent to be bound by the treaty, whichever is later.

Article 21

Legal effects of reservations and of objections to reservations

- A reservation established with regard to another party in accordance with articles 19, 20 and 23:
- modifies for the reserving State or international organization in its relations with that other party the provisions of the treaty to which the reservation relates to the extent of the reservation; and